



Catherine E. Pugh  
Mayor

**COMMISSION FOR  
HISTORICAL & ARCHITECTURAL  
PRESERVATION**

Tom Liebel, Chairman

**STAFF REPORT**



Laurie Feinberg,  
Acting Director

**December 11, 2018**

**REQUEST:** Construct five-story addition along West Baltimore Street (Final)

**ADDRESS:** 1 North Carey (Union Square Historic District)

**RECOMMENDATION:** Approval

**STAFF:** Walter W. Gallas and Caitlin Audette

**APPLICANT:** 1 North Carey St. LLC, Owner  
Phillip Scott, Architect

**SITE/HISTORIC DISTRICT**

General Area: The property is located in the Union Square Historic District at the northeast corner of North Carey and West Baltimore Streets. The Union Square local historic district is a dense area of rowhouses and commercial structures located in Southwest Baltimore. Two major features define the district: Union Square Park, a donation to the city in the 1840s, and Hollins Market with the city's oldest market building. Generally bounded by South Schroeder, West Pratt, South Fulton, and West Baltimore Streets, the area of approximately 21 blocks is comprised of over 1,000 buildings. The district is built on a hierarchical street-grid system laid down over gently sloping terrain by engineer-surveyor Thomas H. Poppleton following the land's 1816 annexation to the city.

Site Conditions

The existing property is a four-story commercial building at the corner of North Carey and West Baltimore Streets. The area where the proposed addition will be located is to the east of the existing building at the northwest corner of West Baltimore Street and Stockton Street. To the north of the existing vacant lot are three three-story rowhomes that face Stockton. Adjacent along West Baltimore Street, across Stockton Street is a one-story commercial building. Opposite West Baltimore Street are a variety of three-story commercial buildings.

The historic brick building at 1 North Carey was constructed in 1894. The building was constructed with funds from a legacy of Mr. Humphrey Moore, which created the Moore Institute. The building was immediately leased to the Y.M.C.A to fulfill Mr. Moore's legacy which as stated in the *Baltimore Sun* in 1894 was, "for the purpose of erecting in the western section of the city an institute or hall where young men could meet for literary purposes and debate the topics of the day." The building included an auditorium, classroom spaces, and a gymnasium. Today the building is in a state of disrepair with much of the interior completely demolished, many windows missing or removed and modified storefronts that are in disrepair.

The vacant lot where the proposed addition will be located historically housed two three-story brick rowhouses one of which housed a coin laundry and one which housed a store at the ground floors. The buildings were demolished by the city in 1995 following a fire that spurred their condemnation. Since the demolition the site has remained vacant.

## BACKGROUND

- June 4, 1995 – 1218 and 1220 W. Baltimore Street, the two rowhouses at the location of the proposed new addition, were condemned following a fire that caused the collapse of the roof and interior of the properties.
- September 13, 1995 – 1218 and 1220 W. Baltimore Street were demolished by city crews citing conditions dangerous to the public welfare.
- February 25, 2011 – Partial Condemnation Notice Issued by Housing for the historic building at 1 N. Carey Street.
- July 14, 2016 – Condemnation rescinded
- October 18, 2016 – CHAP staff walked site with architect and owner's representative.
- November 28, 2017 – Stop work order for construction work without permit.
- November 30, 2017 – Work without permit: Building fence around building without permits.
- February 15, 2018 – Work without permit: Construction of addition without approval.
- May 21, 2018 – CHAP staff met with architect to review proposed design and suggest modifications.
- At the June CHAP Hearing the commission gave Concept Approval to the applicant with the following recommendations:
  - *Space windows more evenly within the vertical plane, modifying the uppermost window to either be a tall window that responds to the lofted interior space (and resembles the double height window at the historic building), or a smaller window that helps create the cap to the building's composition.*
  - *Revise the building's cornice to better relate to the historic building.*
  - *Use double-hung windows rather than commercial sliding windows.*
  - *Building materials should be compatible with the historic red brick building, taking design cues from the building.*
  - *Remove the alternating brick colors. On a flat plane this styling is awkward. If the architect chose to create protruding bays, the use of an alternative material at this bay could be more appropriate. However, this would be a change to the massing that would need to be reviewed by the full commission. Additionally, a slightly recessed bay, similar to the historic building may give the appearance sought by the architect.*
  - *At the side elevation the lintels and sills that extend from the stairwell windows should be removed.*
  - *Modify the first floor cornice to more be more compatible with the cornice visible at the historic building's storefront.*
  - *Revise the storefront to be more compatible with the historic building.*
- August 31, 2018 – CHAP Staff met with architect to review updates to plan following CHAP hearing.
- October 4, 2018 – CHAP Staff reviewed plan with Planning design staff and emailed architect with suggestions.

## **PROPOSAL & APPLICATION OF GUIDELINES**

The applicant proposes to construct a new addition to the east of the existing building. The five-story addition would be mixed use with commercial space on the first floor and residential space on the second through fifth floors. This application does not include any work to the historic building. The owners have an ATP to clean and repair the masonry and remove vegetation from the building. No other exterior work is approved at this time. The applicant is expected to move forward with the full rehabilitation of the building in coordination with the new construction.

## **ANALYSIS**

Staff applied the following Design Guidelines:

*2.4.1 Building Entrances* states, “Design building entrances to enhance the connection between the street and the building interior,” and “Respect the existing pattern of building entrances when locating new entrances.” The proposal generally meets these guidelines as the proposed entrance is of a larger scale and off center of the building’s mass at the first floor, similar to the entrances to the historic building.

“Design new storefront entrances that are compatible with surrounding commercial buildings.” The proposed design somewhat meets this guideline as the proposed entry is oversized, but more details on the proposed door, transom and signage will allow staff to better understand if this guideline is met.

*2.5.1 Doors and Windows* states, “Design doors and windows to be compatible with the placement, scale, type, and operation of doors and window and their openings in surrounding buildings.” The proposal generally meets this guideline as the proposal references the somewhat unusual pattern of windows found at the historic building, and includes windows at the upper floors connected by a spandrel, alluding to the double height windows at the historic building.

## **NEIGHBORHOOD COMMENTS**

The Union Square ARC has not provided a formal response.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends approval of the proposal with any additional final details to be completed at staff level with the following conditions:

- Information regarding the brick color and mortar color must be provided in context, i.e. viewed adjacent to the historic brick building.
- More detailed specifications provided for windows, doors, and spandrel paneling.
- Clarification that side and rear material cannot be EFIS, and should be stucco.
- Provide detailed information about how the addition will connect to historic building.
- Provide information on materials for the two cornices.
- Note that all signage will need separate approval.
- Provide and receive CHAP staff approval for detailed scope of work for historic building to be completed in conjunction with new construction.

- Provide drawing of rear elevation.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "E. S. ML".

**Eric Holcomb,  
Director**

## MAP AND IMAGES



*Image 1*– 1 N. Carey along West Baltimore Street in the Union Square Historic District.



*Image 2*: 1 N. Carey at corner of W. Baltimore Street and Stockton Street in the Union Square Historic District.





*Image 3:* Image of construction without a permit to begin construction of the new addition.



*Image 4:* Image of construction without a permit to begin construction of the new addition.





*Image 5: Image of construction without a permit to begin construction of the new addition.*



*Image 5: Aerial view of 1 N. Carey as seen from the west (December 2016)*



*Image 6: Aerial view of 1 N. Carey as seen from the south (December 2016)*